

Learning to Read and Write

Introduction to the Basic Tools of Language

The hearts and minds of children not yet able to read should be formed by discussion of themes, listening to books read aloud, and the memorization of poetry. However, children should be given the ability to read and write as soon as possible after they enter school.

Phonics: The Door to the Language Arts Program

The study of phonics teaches the relation between sounds and their written symbols, and so introduces children to the world of writing and reading, allowing them access to the entire language arts program. Phonics is a tool for reading and correct spelling, vital but purely mechanical and therefore subordinate in importance to the elements which are intrinsically meaningful: theme, dictation, reading, poetry, and composition. Teachers should integrate the study of phonics as much as possible into these meaningful elements of the program.

A phonics program should present clear rules for reading and spelling which the students may understand, memorize and practice, and which the teachers of the different grades may use for review as often as necessary. Phonics should be studied until it is mastered, which means, until correct reading and spelling become second nature to the child. Detailed criteria for an effective phonics program may be divided according to the various associated skills it is meant to teach.

The program recommended by the Language Arts Committee as best fulfilling the criteria for learning to read and write in kindergarten and 1st grade is *Spell to Write and Read*, by Wanda Sanseri.¹ Its various elements may be easily adapted for continued phonics review.

The Skills Associated with the Study of Phonics

Learning to Read

A phonics program should teach children to read in a way which respects the nature of language and the nature of the child. The English language is primarily but not entirely phonetic, which means the study of phonics will need to be supplemented by certain sight words. By their nature, children learn gradually, taking in information through all of their senses, advancing by stages from known to unknown. A phonics program should therefore be multisensory, giving every child the greatest possibility to associate sound with symbol according to his dominant sense: sight, hearing, or touch. The program should simplify elements as much as possible: for example, some children have difficulty learning all at once the appearance, name and sound of a letter. Many good programs teach only the appearance and sound of each letter initially. However, it is important that the phonics program appeal to the reason of the child and draw him as quickly as possible to conscious, reflective learning. A phonics program should include explicit definitions and rules, accessible to the child's understanding and which the teacher can take for review in later years, as indicated above. Likewise, the initial practice of reading aloud, as children associate written language with sound, is best done with real words rather than meaningless syllables.

¹ Schools may wish to use the accompanying handwriting program, *Cursive First*, designed by Elizabeth FitzGerald and meant for integration with *Spell to Write and Read*.

Learning to Write and the Perfection of Handwriting

Like the apprenticeship of reading, the method for teaching to write should also respect the nature of language and the nature of the child. First, it is important to note that writing and reading are learned almost simultaneously; in certain very effective programs, writing is learned first and the child then reads his own written words. Writing familiar sounds into words requires less abstraction and leads the child by simpler steps than introducing letters and asking the child to decode writing all in one step. Second, writing demands fine motor skills and should be prepared by other tactile activities such as drawing and coloring, kneading clay into shapes, painting, or writing on a small chalkboard. Finally, the handwriting lines for the youngest grades should encourage precision: they should not be excessively wide and should provide light or dotted guidelines to help indicate the different heights of letters or even their slant. It is important that handwriting be legible and neat, not rigidly identical to a certain model. Finally, schools should bear in mind that left-handed children will encounter difficulties in the writing process, and should consider training all children to be right-handed while their skills are still in formation.

The common form of handwriting in the adult world is cursive, both for ease of writing and for elegance of form. Children also need to know how to print, if only from the purely practical standpoint of knowing how to fill out forms. Both forms of handwriting should be mastered by the end of 3rd grade. It is, however, recommended that schools teach cursive first, and this for several reasons. From a philosophical viewpoint, words in cursive appear as unities, corresponding to the nature of language; aesthetically, cursive is the more pleasing form of handwriting and the form allowing greater variation and therefore more individual expression. From a practical viewpoint, children master more fully the skill which they learn earliest, and the curves of cursive are more natural to an awkward hand than rigid lines and perfect circles.

Schools have a choice of handwriting programs but should implement any program in a way which emphasizes quality over quantity. It would be preferable that children work almost exclusively in permanent lined notebooks or copybooks, so that they learn a greater respect for their work and take greater care with it. Any pre-printed workbook should rest flat enough for students to work neatly.

Spelling and Vocabulary

Correct spelling is a function of the rules of phonics rather than a separate discipline and should always be taught in a way which recalls these rules to the children. Spelling skills are best reinforced and vocabulary developed in conjunction with theme, literature, poetry, dictation, and composition exercises. As far as possible, spelling words should come from these elements, in particular dictation, so that the words will be seen in a context and so retain their meaning, more profoundly penetrating the child's memory than words in a random listing. As the child is learning to read, spelling words may be provided by the phonics progression and should be associated with and supplemented by dictation and reading. Once he can read fluently, spelling words may be provided by literature and dictation alone; a spelling grade may come from a dictation exercise, and extra effort may be focused on individual difficulties. Children should be encouraged to broaden their vocabulary by retaining and using words from their reading.

Using Themes to Deepen and Unify Education

“Themes” in the Language Arts curriculum are universal topics drawn from literature which are selected to be the focus of class discussion over a given period of time, encouraging the children to reflect on natural, noble values present in their everyday lives. Themes help ensure the balanced formation of the mind and heart of the child, educating him toward a deeper insight into human nature and civilization, teaching him that spiritual values exist already on a natural level. Focusing on such themes in the younger grades prepares the children to bring judgment and insight to the later study of literature, and teaches them that literary themes are not something alien to real life.

Themes are essentially unifying. They provide a backdrop for English class, especially in the younger grades: the choice of a weekly theme determines the choice of reading, poetry and dictation, as well as all of the grammar, spelling and handwriting exercises which are based on the reading. Weekly themes are particularly important for giving formational value to kindergarten through 2nd grade, when the study of quality literature tends to constitute only a small portion of Language Arts class. Although these themes are encountered primarily in literature and poetry, they apply naturally to every school subject by their universality, integrating and elevating the entire curriculum. Not only is English class tied into the rest of the curriculum, but the children are learning from the earliest age to integrate the beautiful things they learn in school into the life they lead outside of school.

Because themes set the tone for the English program and for a child’s entire formation, it is important that they be well selected to ensure breadth and balance. These noble realities should always be presented with the help of some beautiful text whose style is elegant and pleasant and whose characters are realistic and appealing. The beauty of the text will correspond to the beauty of the theme studied, so that the noble idea is not falsified in the child’s mind: debased to the level of mere feeling or to the level of a moralizing tool for obtaining good behavior.

Kindergarten, 1st and 2nd grade may follow a biographical “themebook,” determining the theme for every week. The goal is to awaken the very young children to the nobility within their everyday surroundings: the sacred nature of home, family, homeland, or daily duty, as they see those realities incarnated in the daily life of a saint or hero. Before they have reached an age to reflect abstractly on such matters, children learn to view the world they live in as something infused with spiritual values and sacred realities, even on the simplest natural level. Through a themebook they meet the mother and father of young Giuseppe Sarto in a dictation text, for example, learn about his village and his schoolwork. The poem should be chosen to echo the same theme, and the composition topic may ask a child to describe his own home, his own father and the work he does.

After 3rd grade, the literature itself is able to guide the teacher in the choice of theme: he selects the weekly poetry and dictations according to the dominant quality represented in the reading. The children still require very concrete themes: the values of home, family, work, homeland, not yet considered abstractly but as seen through the characters in literature. Composition topics should also reflect the theme in some way, leading the child gradually toward more abstract reflection, as specified in the composition guidelines.

After 6th grade, the array of themes widens to encourage reflection on any noble value, at first still embodied in particular individuals, then gradually considered in itself, abstractly. Thus the younger students will reflect on courage through a passage recounting the deeds or personality of a courageous hero, while older students are reflecting on the very nature of courage.

Through 9th grade, the teacher should still be choosing poetry, dictation and composition topics in function of a specific theme. By the time children are in 10th grade, they have grown accustomed to reflecting seriously upon a concrete, everyday reality animated with spiritual values. After such prolonged and healthy consideration of true and noble ideas, the children will have learned how to read literature with appreciation and insight; the world of culture and ideas opens before them and calls for their own personal reflection. Class discussion is determined by literature; poems and compositions encourage the children to ever deeper penetration of these literary themes.

The Role of Literature in an English Program

The ideas contained in beautiful literary texts are what should animate the entire English program, so that the choice of literature throughout the grades takes on a primary importance. The characters in literature act on the children powerfully, providing them with vicarious experience of life and of the choices it will demand: they should be selected for their truth. The literature program should gradually awaken children to the nobility to which man is called even in the natural order by the fact of his spiritual soul. In this way, genuine literature should prepare an understanding of the harmony between nature and supernature by revealing some truth of human life. These truths give literature a universal quality, independent of time and place. At the same time, genuine literature should bring pleasure to the reader through the beauty of idea and expression.

The literature studied in each class has to be accessible to the students yet always drawing them higher, both by its form and its ideas. Its treatment in class should be a formation of mind and heart, an apprenticeship of personal reflection on the truth contained in beautiful literary creations. The teacher should draw out the universal qualities of the text in a living manner, avoiding two extremes: merely reading aloud with no commentary; or dissecting works in a detached, academic analysis. Books should be chosen primarily for their value in forming the children and leading them toward maturity; literary works of different genres and time periods may be shuffled in the interest of balance or thematic unity, that the universal ideas in each might penetrate the students more deeply.

In Kindergarten through 2nd grade, the goal of literature class is to awaken in the children a sense of wonder toward the world around them, drawing them to notice the daily realities that surround them – family, friendship, homeland, school, or work – and to sense the noble, spiritual quality of those realities, opening onto the infinite. Children are just learning to read, but it is best to move them away from simple phonetic readers as soon as possible, and frequently to read aloud to the children those works which they cannot yet read for themselves. At this age, it is very important that the pictures in children's literature be beautiful as well as the ideas, so as to nourish all of the senses with order and harmony and thus form the children's souls to a love of beauty.

In 3rd through 5th grade, literature class should broaden the horizons of the children, bringing them out of themselves to an awareness of the larger world around them. Literature should continue to nourish the imagination and form the children to a love of beauty and a sense of balance, order and harmony. The teacher should try to instill a love of reading, emphasizing quality over quantity of pages read. Books should be read together in class rather than at home, so that the teacher might train understanding and fluency; however, students may be asked to read at home and prepare certain pages for the following day, so that classroom reading may be more fluid.

Literature in 6th through 8th grade should be even richer in intellectual content. The teacher should be gradually leading the children to draw more abstract principles from the concrete elements of the text, making explicit the moral qualities which they only sensed in the younger grades. While much of the text should still be read aloud and commented in class, the teacher may assign entire chapters to be read at home and prepared for study on a following day.

The study of literature in 9th and 10th grade should be consolidating the transition to abstract reflection and independent reading, as children are asked to read entire works in preparation for class discussion. The teacher should choose excerpts to read and comment together in class, treating the works thematically through a study of the characters and their development. Works may demand discernment on the part of the student and guidance on the part of the teacher. The teacher needs to lead the child not only to understand what the text says but also to judge its value, weighing both its aesthetic and its moral quality. The two pitfalls to be avoided in this analysis are *aestheticism* on the one hand and *moralism* on the other. Aestheticism would judge the work only according to its beauty, ignoring the goodness of the ideas contained. Moralism on the other hand would dismiss all concern for the art of a beautiful expression in order simply to draw out a lesson for the children.

By 11th and 12th grades, students should be increasingly challenged by the literary works. Their contact with beautiful, formative literature should now allow them to approach new texts with discernment and reflection, always under the guidance of the teacher. The number of works studied may increase dramatically, as children are expected to do nearly all of their reading outside of class in preparation for class discussion.

Dictation: Integrating Meaning into Mechanism

Overview: What is Dictation?

The practice of *Dictation* in a meaning-based language arts program serves a double purpose: it places the children in prolonged and attentive contact with beautiful, formative literary passages, and at the same time unifies the different aspects of the language arts program by providing meaningful matter for grammar, spelling, and handwriting. Dictation is therefore a vehicle of meaning, turning otherwise mechanical exercises into a reflection on literature, reinforcing the themes of reading and poetry.

Dictation is appropriate for 1st through 9th grade. The basic exercise is simple: a teacher gives a dictation exercise by reading aloud a short text, while the students listen and write it down. Depending on the grade level, the text will vary in length from two to twenty lines. The teacher reads the passage once through in its entirety, making sure the students grasp the meaning, before rereading it in segments short enough to allow the children to transcribe the words and punctuation accurately. The older the children, the longer the segments should be, so that the memory of the child is fixed upon meaningful phrases and full clauses as often as possible. The teacher may write out certain words or indicate punctuation, depending on the goal of a given exercise.

Dictation exercises may be divided broadly into *Explained Dictations*, in which a given passage is used as an illustration of a grammar or phonics lesson – often written on the board for general perusal, before being erased and then dictated in its entirety; and *Dictation Tests*, in which students are given a passage without previous introduction, to test spelling or punctuation skills. There should be at least one dictation per week, but the teacher may find it useful to introduce several dictations in a week. Children in Kindergarten and 1st grade who are just learning to read may be prepared for dictation exercises by *copy* exercises, transcribing in their notebooks a short sentence which the teacher has written on the board.

Uses of Dictation: Detailed Description

Awakening the Mind and Educating the Moral Judgment

The most important purpose of dictation is to help awaken the children's minds to noble realities. A well-chosen text will focus the students' attention on an exceptional passage from a work which they study in class, or introduce them to a work of literature with which they may not otherwise have come into contact. It likewise helps to form their literary taste and their own writing style by placing them in continual contact with beautiful passages of English prose or poetry.

Secondly, dictation exercises the memory and the listening skills of the child, who must reproduce what he has heard. In this way, it is already a formation of the will as the child is obliged to master himself for the length of the exercise.

Finally, dictation texts provide the matter for the other elements of an English program: they are the source of spelling and vocabulary words and the subject of grammar exercises and handwriting practice. This unity throughout the program itself is significant and formational, as the child learns to make connections between disciplines and maintain reflection on an abstract question throughout various applications.

Source of Spelling Words and Phonics Practice

Dictation can be a source of spelling words, avoiding the randomness of certain vocabulary lists, allowing the teacher to point out phonics rules in a literary context. Rather than inventing more or less meaningful sentences which employ a spelling word, students will be delving deeper into a text of value. The student is more likely to retain and reuse spelling words encountered in a text and therefore held together by a context.

Source of Grammar Exercises

Sentences pulled from dictation can likewise be used as grammar exercises to illustrate the weekly lesson. As students analyze and diagram dictation sentences, passages will enter their memory and the meaning and value of the text will continue to nourish their reflection. Grammar will appear to students in its true light, primarily as a tool for penetrating the meaning of a text.

Opportunity for Handwriting Practice

The very mechanism of handwriting also takes on new meaning when applied to dictation texts. Clear, beautiful handwriting shows a respect not only for the reader but also for the words written, and how better to teach respect for one's own handwriting effort than by transcribing with care a passage of quality, teaching the child to give a worthy form to noble ideas expressed with elegance and style.

Source for Composition Topics

Finally, dictation texts can serve as a basis for writing compositions. A text which is meaningful and which stimulates reflection can be an excellent source of composition topics. The quality of the text will set the tone for student writing while the value of its content interests and inspires the young author.

The practice of dictation is a microcosm of education itself: the child is brought into contact with truth and beauty so that he might come to integrate these realities and express them for himself. Using dictation as the source of composition topics is therefore the logical fulfillment of the exercise, as the child comes slowly and with guidance to express his own ideas and form his own style.

The choice of a passage for use in dictation will depend on the specific purpose of a given exercise: the text should be always be one of quality, but the teacher may also choose passages in function of their vocabulary or sentence structure, better apt to illustrate the weekly lessons. The source of dictation texts is extremely broad: it may simply be taken from the reading book, it may be a text entirely new to the children yet accessible to their understanding, reinforcing the themes of class discussion. Teachers may certainly draw on their own reading material to provide dictation texts.

Teachers will develop their own standards for grading dictations, depending on the goal of a given exercise; they may wish to give an overall grade for faithful transcription, and assign another grade for correct spelling, for example. It is a good idea to ask children to recopy misspelled words several times as part of the correction.

Using Grammar to Sharpen Analysis and Clarify Expression

School grammar may be defined as the study of the laws of language and of the common rules of proper English expression. These two aspects correspond to the double purpose of grammar in a meaning-based language arts program: the refinement of analytical skills first, and consequently the improvement of personal expression. Familiarity with the logical scaffolding of language will gradually build lasting qualities of mind in the children, allowing them to go more quickly to the essential ideas of a text and follow the nuances of an author's expression. Grammar is therefore a tool allowing the children to be more perfectly nourished by the beautiful texts of the literature program. Secondly, following so closely the nuances of an author's thought will give the children the ability to think and to express themselves with greater clarity and precision, even as the beautiful language more deeply nourishes the student's own style. To fulfill this double purpose, grammar has to be studied in a way which maintains it at the service of thought, from the very youngest age. The expression of grammatical rules and definitions should appeal to a child's understanding, corresponding to the reality of language and not merely to a superficial aspect of it. Exercises should lead the student to reflect on complete, meaningful sentences in such a way that he might dominate the thought expressed, rather than training him in a mechanism to identify elements in isolation.

It is preferable that the same person teach literature, dictation, composition, and grammar, to maintain the vital relationship between the elements of the English program. The main grammar lesson of the week is best combined with a dictation exercise: grammar will take on meaning and interest by the illustration, and in turn help the dictation text to penetrate and nourish the child's memory. Thoroughly analyzing every element of one or two sentences whose meaning has been understood will do more for the formation of a lasting quality of thought than will a multitude of repetitive mechanical exercises. Fill-in-the-blank exercises are particularly to be avoided because they ask the child for only a minimum of personal effort and reflection. Whenever the teacher chooses exercises from a book or worksheet, he may have the children copy the exercises completely into a permanent notebook, as a way of better ensuring that they reflect upon the meaning of the sentence. Grammar reviews should be brief but frequent, as the teacher draws from the reading a few examples to illustrate the grammar concept of the week. Grammar will thus appear to the students true to its nature as an integral part of the language arts program.

The most basic elements of meaningful language are the individual words making up a sentence. The student analyzes the words of a sentence through "parsing," identifying the nature of the word in itself and in its relation to other words in the sentence. Parsing should lead the student to identify with precision the nature, form and function of a given word within a given complete expression.

Such accurate identification can only take place if the expression as a whole has been understood. In literature, students will quickly encounter sentences made up of a series of more or less complete thoughts, subordinated within a larger overall thought. They need to possess the concepts and logical categories by which to name and understand the relation of the various clauses and phrases within complex or compound sentence, identifying the nature, form and function of each clause and phrase. The process by which a given

expression is broken down into its component phrases and clauses is called logical analysis; it trains the child to discern what is of primary significance in an expression and define the relation of all secondary elements.

Full written analysis may be supplemented but not replaced by sentence diagramming, which is a way of representing a whole sentence by a picture, showing at a glance the relation of its parts. The inherent weakness of a sentence diagram is that it shows the fact of a relation between words and phrases – drawing a line from the main clause to a subordinate clause, for example, showing subordination – but it cannot specify the profound or precise nature of that relation. Diagramming may be useful for consolidating a child's understanding, but can only be the illustration of a relation already understood intellectually, and which the child should be able to express in words.

If it is to be effective in forming lasting qualities of mind, the study of grammar should also be gradual and cumulative. Beginning already in 2nd grade, the study of grammar should be instilling a very solid grasp of the basic elements of sentences, adding definitions and nuances every year while constantly reviewing the basic realities. This review occurs naturally by the very fact of using whole-sentence exercises and by using cumulative, increasingly exhaustive parsing and logical-analysis charts. Teachers from 2nd through 9th grade should use consistent definitions and expressions as well as similar forms for charting written analysis, everything increasing in detail as the years go by, giving the student an ever sharper tool of understanding. By the end of 9th grade, students should possess all of the distinctions necessary for the analysis of even the most complex, Latinate English sentence, drawn from any one of the works of literature studied. It goes without saying that such a grasp of English grammar and the subtleties of syntax will give the children considerable ease in the learning of foreign languages.

The Language Arts Committee recommends the use of the *Classical Grammar* series published by Angelus Press, as the textbooks which best correspond to the nature of grammar and the exigencies of a meaning-based language arts curriculum. It is in fact a revised and augmented edition of the *Baskervill-Sewell English Course*. Book 1 is intended for 2nd through 4th grade; Book 2 is appropriate for 5th through 7th or 8th grade; Book 3 is a comprehensive grammar guide appropriate for 9th grade grammar class or as a reference book for high school students. Teacher guides published by the Language Arts Committee indicate the ideal grammar progression and grammar goals for each grade, corresponding to the *Classical Grammar* series.

Compositions to Educate the Heart and Mind

Composition is a written exercise of personal expression which calls upon all aspects of the language arts program, proving and at the same time increasing the child's mastery of each element. Its role in every grade is to deepen the child's understanding of the noble realities which are the soul of English class and draw him to make them his own, by asking him to continue pondering beyond class discussion and then express his own reflections in a way which is original, elegant, clear, and orderly.

Every composition topic should therefore lead the child to reflect independently upon the elements which have nourished his understanding and sparked his interest and imagination (literature, poetry, and theme in particular). The child should express his thoughts in a personal and well-organized manner, drawing upon the vocabulary and style absorbed in poetry and dictation, and upon the rules of spelling and grammar practiced every day of the week. Finally, his efforts are to be recorded in his best handwriting, preferably in a series of permanent notebooks chronicling his progress over the year and throughout his school career. As the child grows, composition topics should grow with him, training qualities of reflection and analysis, as well as maturity of feeling and elegance of style.

For this gradual formation to take place, composition topics must not simply be mechanical exercises of form taken from a composition textbook. Topics are best created by the teacher based on class discussion of literature and themes, drawing students to continue pondering in a way which is ever more personal and profound. For the child to succeed and progress, the teacher should spend time preparing the children for the topic, explaining the writing process and then offering detailed evaluations of the children's work.

Student writing can be divided into two categories, developing two main types of reflection. *Topic compositions* accompany the child from 2nd grade through 12th, asking him to develop a theme from literature or class discussion which is increasingly broad and increasingly abstract as the child progresses. *Text-Analysis compositions*, appearing in different forms depending on the grade level, ask the child to analyze a particular, brief literary selection and comment on it with increasing detail and maturity.

Composition exercises in these two categories incorporate the various elements of style, structure, and method which children need to develop if they are to become good writers. Dividing the exercises according to type of reflection is based on the most essential element of self-expression: the thought to be expressed. Mastery of technique will be learned at the same time, always considered as a tool appropriate for expressing a given thought. Thus, children will learn about sentence and paragraph structure, topic sentences and essay structure; expository, persuasive, descriptive, narrative, and imaginative writing; organization, voice, word choice, sentence fluency, unity and coherence, audience, and proper punctuation; brainstorming, outlining, rough draft construction, and proofreading... as they become necessary for the expression of more and more complex and profound ideas.

Within an integrated curriculum, all subjects should have writing assignments proper to the matter. However, the English teacher may need to give certain remedial lessons in report structure which should not occupy too much time.

Topic Compositions

General Guidelines for Creating Composition Topics

Precise

All composition topics should be precise so that the child knows where to focus his efforts. This means avoiding writing assignments in which the child is asked to create his own topic, or write simply what comes into his mind (journal writing). If the child is asked to create a composition topic, it should be within certain parameters ensuring the quality and pertinence of the reflection. The teacher may base the topic on some work studied, integrating a brief quote, to make a clear connection with class discussion. Precise, well-chosen topics will allow a broader, more meaningful development, ultimately allowing the child fuller play of his own powers of imagination and reflection.

Universal

In order to allow this breadth of development, composition topics should be related to themes which are in some way universal, or treating of common human experience. This guideline applies even to the younger grades, before the child is of an age to develop these themes abstractly (topics relating to home, family, patriotism, for example, which are considered concretely at first but open onto a larger perspective).

Uplifting

In order for the child's reflection to develop in a way which continues to form his heart and mind, topics should be uplifting; they will be so naturally if their subject matter is universal, following on works studied and class discussion. This guideline does not mean that themes of evil or disordered aspects of certain works should never be treated, but that they should be approached in such a way as to show their disorder and the larger harmony which does exist, both in reality and in true literature.

Objective

In order for composition to continue the formation of mind and heart, topics should be as objective as possible, drawing the child out of himself to reflect on the world around him. Topics which ask for first person narrative are appropriate for 2nd and 3rd grade, but by 4th grade the teacher should be introducing topics which demand reflection on a broader experience: topics about characters in the works studied, about people beyond the child's immediate family, or about the physical world beyond the home.

Intriguing

Finally, topics will spark the child's interest and encourage greater development if they contain some dilemma to be resolved or if they continue class discussion of some disputed point. (This guideline applies particularly as the children progress beyond the stage of simply telling a story or an episode from their own lives.)

Grade-Specific Guidelines for Composition Topics

In 2nd and 3rd grade, it is best to give a single topic, one which is very simple and concrete, asking for a story within the child's own experience. It should be related as far as possible to the themes in the literature being studied. Topics should follow the general guidelines as much as possible, touching on themes of common human experience in a form which is uplifting, without expecting abstract development. Topics asking the child to imagine a story should be precise enough to prevent his wandering into vague silliness and absurd invention. The child should be taught to introduce and conclude his thought with a special sentence. The child is expected to write a single paragraph in 2nd grade, very short at first and gradually longer. He should be able to write two or more paragraphs by the end of 3rd grade, but the teacher should always encourage a complete and original thought with a proper sequence of events rather than a long composition. He should be taught that an entirely new thought should be expressed in a new paragraph, slowly introducing him to the idea of a multi-paragraph composition. As he advances through the various grades, the child should be learning that idea is more important than form, but that form is essential to the clear expression of the idea.

In 4th and 5th grade, the topics should gradually move away from first-person narrative and toward reflection on works studied. As always, the topics should encourage reflection on noble realities and avoid anything which could degenerate into vulgarity: the quote chosen to introduce the topic should set the tone. The child should be capable of writing three or four paragraph compositions by the end of 5th grade, with a clear introductory sentence for each paragraph and an introductory and concluding sentence for the composition as a whole. Students should be learning about proper transition between paragraphs, necessary for a clear transition of ideas. As in 2nd and 3rd grade, the teacher should encourage completion, order and originality more than length.

In 6th and 7th grade, children should only rarely be asked to recount their own experiences in a first person narrative. Topics should ask for a more prolonged reflection on noble ideas, yet these ideas should still be incarnated in specific literary characters as far as possible. Thus a child in 6th grade may be asked to write about a courageous character in the work being studied and comment on his courage, rather than being asked to write about courage abstractly. Some imagination topics should still be given, as precise as possible and stemming as much as possible from works studied. Compositions should be at least five paragraphs long, with introduction, conclusion and clear transition.

From 8th grade onward, topics become more abstract and demand ever deeper personal reflection on ideas. However, even when the child is asked to write on an abstract notion or quality, he should always base his reflection on a concrete work or example to avoid pontificating. Basing topics on works studied will help to ground students in reality and oblige them to greater rigor in proving their statements. Compositions need not be substantially longer in 8th grade than in 6th, but should be more penetrating. By 10th grade, students should be able to fill four sides of letter-sized pages.

No guidelines are specified above for the time given weekly to tests and writing assignments. Children in 2nd and 3rd grade should write 30 to 40 minutes, in class; in 4th through 7th, this should increase to an hour, with some writing assignments to be composed at home; after 8th grade, assignment writing should be done at home, only tests at school; at least 2 hours are naturally required for sufficient development of the topic.

Preparing the Children to Write

Preparing the children to express their own thoughts means teaching them how to develop and organize those thoughts, and then how to find the proper form for communicating them. The primary element has to be the idea, or composition will become a mere exercise in mechanics, devoid of intrinsic interest for the child and therefore devoid of educational value. Yet, the child should understand that the quality and organization of his writing will prove the quality of his thought, because only what is clearly conceived can be clearly expressed. Likewise, he should see that giving a proper form to his writing will help him to identify and focus on those elements which are essential, allowing him continually to surpass himself and take his reflection deeper.

The remote and continual preparation for writing is class discussion, as well as literature and dictation which are gradually nourishing his imagination with forms of elegant style and with a broadening vocabulary. The child's thinking will naturally model itself on the teacher's presentation of a work or an idea, as he leads the class to reflect together on what is most interesting or essential and to draw conclusions. In particular, the children should be learning that to go deeper means always asking *why*.

The more immediate preparation for writing is to teach the child first to gather ideas, then to group related ideas and organize them based on some natural or logical order, such as chronology or hierarchy of causes. This organization of ideas should push the child to further reflection, as he uncovers related ideas or realizes that he needs to be more precise in his analysis. This outline should be the basis of the various paragraphs of the composition.

Such outlining or class brainstorming may be very basic in the early grades when topics are less abstract. Rough draft writing will also be useful in the younger grades, as the children learn to see that the events they have written are not in order and need to be rewritten. As the children progress, rough drafts should give way entirely to outlining.

Topic compositions allow a wide variety of forms of writing; the teacher may want to assign a topic to be treated in the form of a written speech, a debate or a letter, for example. Preparation for writing will include coaching in the elements proper to those forms. Certain books containing such elements are recommended as teacher supplements.

There is also a preparation for writing included in the class correction of previous assignments, as children see the errors they have made and are taught how to avoid them. Rewriting flawed compositions can be a good way of preparing for better writing in the future. However, the spark of interest which leads to good writing will be lost if the initial idea is belabored by repeated correction. The main sources of improvement are the child's own desire and interest, as well as his repeated effort. Many short assignments – at least one every two weeks – will therefore be more useful in improving student writing than a handful of longer assignments progressively rewritten.

The teacher should be able to point out conventions of style in literature and encourage them in student writing: images, analogies and other literary devices, effective use of quotations, and so on. He should also encourage variety of sentence structure and breadth of vocabulary. However, he should avoid coaching the children to include such conventions or to seek out complicated vocabulary merely as ends in themselves. Simple structure and clear, precise vocabulary are much to be preferred if they are better suited to the idea.

Text-Analysis Compositions

Topic compositions teach the children to develop broad themes, either using their imaginations to tell a story, or else treating more abstract notions, incorporating different elements and ideas in a synthetic manner. Text analysis compositions train children especially in precision of analysis, gradually teaching them to present a particular literary passage in a systematic and rigorous manner.

The passage to be analyzed needs to be relatively short, about the length of a dictation for a given age group; most of all, it should be a passage worthy of study by its ideas and its beauty. According to the age of the child, the *text-analysis* will take one of three forms: for 2nd through 5th grade, it is a simple *retelling of a story*; for 5th through 9th grade, it becomes a *guided commentary*, with questions helping the student draw out the essential elements of meaning and style; for 9th through 12th, it reaches maturity in a simple *commentary*, in which the student draws out these elements for himself, structuring his own commentary on the text, which is by now longer and introduces more abstract ideas.

Like *topic compositions*, *text-analysis compositions* are meant to form the heart and mind of the child and open him to the good and the beautiful. It is important to choose texts which spark the interest of the child and at the same orient his reflection toward noble realities. A text chosen for study should be one in which the truth is expressed with beauty, for the child's ability to think straight and to write well are awakened through contact with the great writers. Such a text not only has the power to awaken to the beautiful, but great authors put the soul in motion: they set a spark in the child, enflaming a desire to proceed deeper in reflection, beyond the text itself.

Retelling the Story: 2nd – 5th Grade

Retelling the story is the simplest form of *text-analysis*. It is an exercise in memory and attention and therefore resembles a dictation, but it also gives practice in self-expression. The teacher reads a story of a few sentences in 2nd grade, or up to two paragraphs in 5th grade, and the student is expected to retell the story, preferably in his own words, beginning to end, with particular attention to the order of events. In 2nd grade, the teacher reads the text three times; by the end of 5th grade, he may read it only once. If the student repeats the facts in the order in which they occurred, he is already composing a well-structured story by imitation.

Guided Commentary: 5th – 9th Grade

Guided commentary is introduced toward the end of 5th grade and is practiced through 9th grade. Students are presented with a series of broad questions about the selected passage, which they are expected to answer in their own words, incorporating a quote into each answer and justifying their reasons. There should be five to seven questions in a 5th grade *guided commentary*, four to five questions in 8th and 9th grade, arranged in clusters so that the students, by their answers, already compose paragraphs into an essay.

The purpose of this exercise is to develop the student's causal thinking, teaching him to understand the chain of events in the text or the chain of logic, and verifying that

he is indeed remaining faithful to the text itself in his answer. Questions should be well chosen so that the child learns how to draw the essential elements out of the text, namely: the chain of events or ideas presented; their importance in the context of the larger work if the text is taken from the reading; the value of those ideas; the stylistic tools used to present the ideas and which make up the material beauty of the text.

The *guided commentary* is an important extension of literature class, not only an exercise in reading but an exercise in contemplation, as teacher and students work to penetrate the text and allow its truth and beauty in turn to penetrate into them. The children should be made sensitive both to the value of the text in itself and to its relative or historical value, as a work issuing from a certain cultural context. The teacher should lead the children toward an openness and attention to the text itself, humble yet always evaluating, seeking the thought of the author and not hastily imposing an interpretation. This attention implies a respect for something true and profound, and the teacher should awaken the children to the qualities of tone and expression which they might have overlooked in their haste or immaturity. Even the choice of punctuation carries nuances of which the children should be made aware.

Commentary: 10th – 12th Grade

The *commentary* may be introduced toward the end of 9th grade and should allow the student to put into practice the skills learned in *guided commentary*. The student is expected to judge for himself what points are essential and organize the treatment of a passage from literature. There is an unlimited possibility for variety in a student *commentary*, whose only invariable guideline is that he remain faithful to the true character of the work and support his judgments with quotes from the text itself.

The student should lead his reader through the text from the outside in. He should first introduce his commentary by briefly situating the passage in its context, whether literary or historical, and tell the period and genre of the work studied. Thus, for a speech or dialogue in a passage taken from a play, the student should explain who is speaking and the importance of the passage to the development of the plot. He briefly should point out the ideas and tone which predominate in the passage, and at the same time give a hint of the role of these ideas in the work as a whole.

The body of the commentary should develop these same ideas, taking care to remain close to the text and show in detail how the author conveys his ideas. The student should not simply pass through the text in a narrative manner, retelling the story, but structure his commentary in an intelligent and original way so as to give the reader a clear view of the whole. He should point out specific rhetorical tools used by the author, the images employed, the general atmosphere of the text and the word choice and syntax which help convey that atmosphere. He should show in greater detail the relation of the passage to the development of the plot and the themes of the work as a whole. He should express the writer's purpose in the work as far as possible, as well as the expectations and reactions of the audience.

The student should conclude his analysis with a synthesis of what he has already stated, giving a final summary for his reader of the nature and value of the text. He may conclude with his own judgment of the work or with suggestions for continued reflection; finishing with a question can be effective.

Preparing Students to Write Text-Analysis Compositions

The gradual stages of *text-analysis* compositions build toward the final, most difficult exercise of *commentary*. At the *retelling the story* stage, the exercise is fairly simple to prepare because the children will be used to receiving dictations. Rather than writing the dictation immediately, they listen and write from memory. The teacher may wish to lead them orally through the exercise the first few times, helping them remember the essential. Much of training will be in the correction of previous exercises. The text chosen should be very short in the beginning of 2nd grade, gradually lengthening and naturally training the child to remember more accurately. The teacher prepares for *guided commentary* by explaining what is required, asking simple questions initially, and gradually making them more challenging. The skill of the child improves by increments, very naturally. By the time he is in 10th grade, the previous eight years have trained him to go to the essential and ask himself the right questions, using quotes to prove his answers. Preparation for writing will include modeling this reflection as a class discussion, much as for topic compositions.

Rubric for Grading Compositions

There can be no set rubric for assigning a number grade to a composition – topic compositions or text-analysis compositions – but the teacher’s criteria for grading should be clear and prioritized as well as consistently applied. These criteria should be communicated to the students, so that they might understand their grade and see where they should improve.

As a general principle, whatever the grading rubric, elements of thought and meaning should be weighted more heavily than elements of form, since mechanics are at the service of idea and education. The first criterion by which a composition should be judged is therefore whether or not the student treated the topic assigned: an off-topic composition cannot receive a passing grade. The teacher should then consider how well the topic is treated: What is the depth and quality of the ideas expressed by the student, according to his age? Is there evidence of real personal reflection and originality or has the student simply regurgitated the statements of the teacher? How well does the student maintain his focus on the topic, tightly building his story or his argument paragraph by paragraph, sentence by sentence, without tangents or superfluous development? Does a story follow an appropriate sequence of events, does an argument use appropriate quotations, and does the whole build to a coherent conclusion? Is vocabulary chosen for its accuracy and pertinence or does the student seem to have written thesaurus in hand, using words he does not fully understand? Has the student used proper spelling and punctuation? Is his handwriting legible and is the paper clearly and neatly presented?

Teachers should avoid assigning high grades too easily, in order to encourage good students to strive for excellence and continually surpass themselves. Compositions are meant to present noble ideas and universal notions – even when the form is that of a narrative – and children should learn that such a topic is inexhaustible, allowing for no perfect treatment of it and therefore no *perfect* paper. Our very manner of grading thus continues to foster in the children a respect for the great ideas.

The Use of Permanent Notebooks

Permanent notebooks should be used wherever possible in the various elements of the language arts program, in order to encourage students' respect for their studies and so contribute to the formation of lasting qualities.

The number of notebooks is at the discretion of the teacher, depending on the organization of his class. A notebook should be used for poetry, dictation, composition, grammar exercises, and handwriting, although more than one subject may be contained in a single notebook. Exercises contained in a grammar or phonics book may also be copied into the permanent notebook, helping students better to reflect on the questions. Teachers may want students to have one or more informal notebooks for taking notes or copying down exercises done as a class. The teacher may find it useful to have color-coded notebooks for use in the different elements of language arts.

Notebooks should be chosen for their quality, with pages that lend themselves to neat handwriting. They should have lines narrow enough to encourage precision, with guidelines according to the age of the children; the weight and brightness of the pages should take ink smoothly without bleeding through; the cover should be rigid enough to survive transportation back and forth from the students' homes; notebooks should lay open flat, and should be thin enough for the student's hand to rest comfortably for writing.

The teacher should specify the format he wants in these notebooks: the heading to put on each page, for example, the margins to leave around writing, whether or not to begin new assignments on a new page, and any marks or lines to indicate the end of an assignment. Defacing notebooks should not be tolerated. This format should be school-wide as far as possible, for the sake of simplicity, and to ensure that all teachers insist on the same elegance and neatness.

Notebooks cease to hold the same importance by 10th grade, when language arts class consists primarily in literature, poetry and composition, with fewer written exercises. Students should always be encouraged to save their compositions in a permanent folder.

Related to the question of notebooks is the question of writing implements. Students should be encouraged to write tests and exercises in ink as soon as possible. The teacher should encourage or impose the use of ink- or gel-pens, which allow the students to write more smoothly and therefore more neatly than ball-point pens.